I. SUMMARY

1. The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (IACHR) decides to lift these precautionary measures in favor of the men and women deprived of liberty in the Cabimas Pretrial Detention Center (Cabimas Remand Facility), in Venezuela. At the time of making the decision, the Commission regretted the persistence of the risk prior to the closure of the Cabimas Remand Facility, which was evicted on October 22, and 23, 2021. On October 26, 2021, its demolition began. Subsequently, the Commission has not received additional information from the representation since November 15, 2021, despite requests for information made. The IACHR decided to lift these measures and regretted the lack of response from the State regarding the specific measures adopted to implement these measures while they were in force.

II. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

2. On February 6, 2020, the IACHR decided to grant precautionary measures to men and women deprived of their liberty at the Cabimas Pretrial Detention Center, as well as those who work there and those who enter as visitors, in Venezuela. The request alleged that the persons of the Center identified therein faced multiple risk factors such as overcrowding, lack of adequate medical care, acts of violence, the presence of firearms, etc. Having analyzed the allegations presented, the Commission considered that the information provided showed prima facie that the beneficiaries were in a serious and urgent situation, given that their rights to life and personal integrity are at serious risk. Consequently, in accordance with Article 25 of the Rules of Procedure, the Commission requested Venezuela to:

a. immediately adopt the necessary measures to protect the life and personal integrity of the beneficiaries. These measures must be adopted by the State in light of the differentiated conditions of persons deprived of their liberty, especially pregnant women and those who are mothers;

b. adopt the relevant measures to adapt the described situation to the applicable international standards regarding the treatment of persons deprived of their liberty, which may include confiscating weapons that are found in the possession of inmates, reducing overcrowding and improving conditions of detention, providing medical care to those who require it, having qualified and sufficient personnel to ensure adequate and effective control, custody and surveillance of the center, separating convicted persons from those who are not convicted, among other measures;

c. consult and agree upon the measures to be adopted with the representatives of this precautionary measure;
d. report on the measures adopted to investigate the alleged events that gave rise to this resolution, so as to prevent such events from reoccurring¹.

3. The representative organization is “Una ventana a la libertad.”

III. INFORMATION PROVIDED DURING THE TIME THESE MEASURES WERE IN FORCE

4. During the time the precautionary measures were in force, the Commission followed up on the subject matter of these precautionary measures by requesting information from the parties. Following the granting, the Commission has requested specific information on the situation of the beneficiaries. The State has not responded to any of the requests for information. On the other hand, the representation sent reports on March 2, April 21, and July 16, 2020, which were forwarded to the State on August 26, 2020. The representation sent updated information on October 1, 2020, March 14, and November 15, 2021. This information was forwarded to the State on September 26, 2022, also requesting additional and updated information from the representation “in order to evaluate whether to keep the precautionary measures in force.” The representation did not provide a response.

5. On February 3, 2023, both parties were summoned to participate in the Public Hearing “Follow-up of precautionary measures of beneficiaries deprived of their liberty in Venezuela”, which took place on-site, on March 6, 2023, at the UCLA Meyer & Renee Luskin Conference Center, in Los Angeles California, within the framework of the 186th Ordinary Period of Sessions of the IACHR². The parties did not confirm their attendance.

6. Lastly, on March 6, 2023, the Commission again requested information from the representation with a view to analyzing whether these precautionary measures shall remain in force. No response was received from the representation.

- Information provided by the representation

7. In its communication of March 2, 2020, the representation reported that two inmates lost their lives in the Center: one due to a respiratory infection in the early morning of February 16, 2020. He found out from other inmates that, weeks ago, he had contracted tuberculosis. Another was killed in Cellblock C by a courtyard inmate in a possible fight. The investigations were taken over on February 16, 2020, by the Scientific, Penal, and Criminal Investigations Service Corps (CICPC). In addition, they reported that the governor of Zulia ratified the intention to close the remand facility of Cabimas, according to statements that he allegedly gave on February 19, 2020, where he indicated that in order to make progress in the closure, the transfer of inmates must be carried out, which is being coordinated with the Ministry of Penitentiary Affairs.

8. In the report of April 21, 2020, the death of three detainees, the murder of another detainee, and the death of an inmate due to gunshot wounds after his escape were reported. The first was found by his cellmates on March 5, 2020; the necropsy revealed that he had died of tuberculosis complicated by other pathologies. The second died on March 15, 2020, also from tuberculosis. The third died on March 25, 2020, after escaping from the prison on December 10, 2020, he was found in an operation of the National Guard of Venezuela (GNB), losing his life after using weapons to evade the GNB

² The hearing, which was held without the participation of the State and with the presence of representations of other precautionary measures, is available at OAS: IACHR: Hearings (oas.org).
when they arrived. A fourth inmate died on the morning of April 2, 2020, of tuberculosis. No details were
given regarding the inmate who was killed. In addition, they reported that the entry of food and medicine
was reduced due to the announcement of the closure of the prison and that, for a few days, the entry of
visitors was suspended. When the visits resumed, the COVID-19 quarantine was announced, which again
caused a decrease in the food entry. It was noted that disinfections were performed; however, the
tuberculosis isolation area was not disinfected or cleaned. Lastly, it was indicated that a newborn entered
the women’s annex, she was the daughter of one of the 11 reported pregnant women in the area, indicating
that the necessary conditions for the baby are not met and that the mother does not have resources to
process the permission before the court.

9. In the report of July 16, 2020, the representation informed five new deaths in the prison.
On May 4, 2020, the death of two inmates was reported: a criminal gang had allegedly hired two inmates
to murder the prison “Pran” (leader), paying guards to enter firearms. When the inmates entered the area,
the leader had been warned and killed the two inmates. On June 1, a prisoner died of tuberculosis and an
outbreak of a respiratory disease was subsequently informed. The “Pranes” threw out all those who had
symptoms, forcing about 100 deprived of liberty, who were malnourished, with fever, diarrhea, cough,
and discomfort, to spend the night in the sand, without bathrooms or water. On June 27, 2020, with
patients outside the Remand Facility, a shooting took place between the “Pranes” of the cellblocks and the
officials of the Bolivarian Police Corps of the State of Zulia (CPBEZ), the GNB, the Municipal Police of
Cabimas, and the Municipal Police of La Costa Oriental del Lago. Six grenades were detonated, the burst
of shots lasted four hours, and a cell next to the prison was burned; two dead inmates were reported.
Lastly, it was indicated that sick detainees, mostly with tuberculosis or respiratory problems, have not
received medical attention. A legal medicine delegation from the Public Ministry entered the prison.
However, they did not supply medication or order transfers to health centers.

10. The report of October 1, 2020, reported the death of four detainees, in addition to protests
by inmates on at least five occasions due to restrictions on the entry of food and drinking water carried
out by the GNB. It was reported that two of the deaths were murders committed in July 2020 for alleged
resistance to authority following their escape. The other two deaths took place also in July 2020 shortly
after they were released on parole due to their health condition since they were in critical condition with
tuberculosis and they had not received medical attention in prison.

11. The representation indicated that, after having publicly denounced on its website, on June
28, 2020, about 150 inmates with pathologies were kept in the open air in the surroundings of the prison,
forced to live under the sun and sleep in the sand. They managed to get a medical committee in three days
later. Eighty-eight inmates were treated in four hours. However, it was indicated that no tuberculosis
medication was given to any of the confirmed cases, which were about 20. On July 26, the Ministry of
Security entered to deliver nine balls to encourage sport. In August, the inmates asked help to buy food
and, with threats from the “Pranes” (leaders) to the officials, the weekly entry of religious organizations
to distribute food has been allegedly achieved. However, after one of the members of one of the
organizations was caught in a shoot-out between cell leaders, this benefit was suspended.

12. On the other hand, it was reported that, on September 2, there was an attack on a
hardware store in Cabimas, for which the “Pran” of Cellblock B was responsible. Consequently, the closure
of the entries to the premises was ordered, cameras were installed, patrols with drones were carried out,
the visits of relatives were prevented, and the entry of food and the truck that sells water was limited. On
September 7, 2020, the inmates held a peaceful protest to request drinking water and food, after which
some admissions were allowed. However, on September 17, a group of inmates forcefully tried to enter a
residence next to the prison to search for water and food. The incident was controlled by the authorities.
13. On September 18, 2020, the Secretary of Citizen Security and Public Order of Zulia met with the commander of the GNB of Cabimas and managed to enter food and water for three days by the military. On September 21, a confrontation with firearms took place between officials and inmates, leaving the prison without electricity for 36 hours after an electric transformer was hit with a projectile. This led to a new restriction of the entry of food. On September 28, 2020, detainees left the premises and took an avenue to protest. It was reported that around 150 inmates spent three hours on the street asking for water, food, and medicine, “without shirts, without masks, some on crutches and others on the shoulders of their fellow inmate” and, after obtaining access to food, they returned to the prison and their routine activities without any shot being fired.

14. On March 14, 2021, a report was sent with a detailed account of the information provided during the time the measures were in force. In addition, updated information was provided, indicating that six new deaths had occurred. On October 14, 2020, detainees threw the body of a person who died of tuberculosis onto the street, indicating that medication had been previously demanded for him. On October 20, 2020, the death of another inmate due to respiratory arrest was reported. On 25 October, they indicated that it was required that three inmates receive an emergency transfer. They were able to get them in a vehicle from the CPBEZ. However, it was informed that within a few minutes, they returned in the same condition. On August 27, 2020, at 8:00 a.m., the inmates left the body without a shirt of another inmate, for whom medical attention was requested 72 hours before, so that the authorities could take care of his transfer to the morgue. On October 30, 2020, the death of another prisoner was informed. He was shot dead by the GNB after trying to escape and allegedly shooting with a revolver. On November 16, 2020, a prisoner in the former civil servants’ area died of tuberculosis and malnutrition; it was indicated that he had been requesting a humanitarian measure. On November 20, 2020, another prisoner died of tuberculosis. On January 11, 2021, another death due to tuberculosis was reported, after no humanitarian measure was authorized.

15. According to the report, a list was provided by the inmates: 15 inmates in Cellblock C are at risk for tubercles; 16 women in Cellblock D or the Women’s Cellblock have different pathologies; 11 inmates in Cellblock A or the Isolation Cellblock have symptoms of tuberculosis; and, 13 inmates in the Former Public Servants Cellblock suffer from different conditions. It was emphasized that medical days are very limited. It is alleged that not everyone receives medical care, they do not provide medication, and they allegedly give you a list of your medical tests to pay for at a clinic.

16. On the other hand, it was reported that, in November 2020, they began to relax measures for COVID-19, allowing visits on Saturdays, however, the GNB continued with a strict control of the entry of supplies, including drinking water. They indicated that when water is scarce, they have to use hydraulic pumps in wells with salty water that causes diarrhea, not being suitable for consumption; however, that is what they have to drink when they are not allowed to enter water. In addition, they indicated that the transfer to health centers is restricted and that, when they get it using their own resources to pay for gasoline, the Hospital of Cabimas has not got the necessary equipment or supplies for their care. In relation to the above, they reported that on January 7, 2023, an inmate had to give birth in the annex with the help of other inmates, which caused the baby to get infected by a bacterium when cutting the cord.

17. Furthermore, they indicated that there has not been a director or administrative staff for the center, since January 2020, having only external custody of CPBEZ officers and, due to a confrontation with grenades at the end of July, the external custody ended and the GNB established a guard 200 meters from the site, without entering to the prison, even to lift corpses, which is why the custodians themselves took out the bodies to be lifted.
18. The last report of the representation was presented on November 15, 2021, where they informed that on October 26, 2021, the Cabimas Pretrial Detention Center was demolished. They reported that before its demolition there were 1,500 inmates, of whom 162 were women and that the eviction of the center had the participation of the “Presidential Commission for the Judicial Revolution” chaired by representative Yonder Durán, which made a diagnosis of the legal and health conditions of each person in the center and the habitability of the premises. In this regard, it was informed that 76 persons were released on August 26, 2020, and 260 were released on parole on September 7, 2021. They added that before the demolition, on September 8, 2021, the death of a person who requested humanitarian action or at least the transfer to a health center and suffered from severe malnutrition and tuberculosis was reported. Furthermore, on September 20, 2021, they indicated the escape of the leader of the Cellblock of former public servants, who had denounced corruption in the presidential commission.

19. In connection with the eviction from prison, it was reported that 36 women and former civil servants were transferred to the Ana María Campos Training Centre on October 3, despite the fact that two of them had cancer. On October 12, an immunization against COVID-19 and yellow fever, and a diagnosis were made to 213 detainees. The last family visit to the prison was on October 16, 2021, and on October 22 and 23, the five cellblocks of the Cabimas Remand Facility were completely evicted.

20. The representation provided information on the public coverage given to the closure and demolition of the prison, especially by the Governor. In turn, they reported that the representative organization "Una ventana a la libertad" recorded that, since 2017, 121 inmates have died: 72 for tuberculosis and other diseases, 17 for fights, and 32 at the hands of security forces after escaping from the prison. Names and details of deaths per year were provided. Furthermore, accounts of the neglect of the released persons with health conditions and no place to go, after being released one day in the afternoon without prior notice were provided.

IV. ANALYSIS OF THE REQUIREMENTS OF URGENCY, SERIOUSNESS, AND IRREPARABLE HARM

21. The precautionary measures mechanism is part of the Commission’s function of overseeing compliance with the human rights obligations set forth in Article 106 of the Charter of the Organization of American States. These general oversight functions are established in Article 41(b) of the American Convention on Human Rights, as well as in Article 18(b) of the IACHR Statute. The mechanism of precautionary measures is set forth in Article 25 of the Commission’s Rules of Procedure. In accordance with this Article, the IACHR grants precautionary measures in urgent and serious situations in which these measures are necessary to avoid irreparable harm to persons or to the subject matter of a petition or case before the organs of the inter-American system.

22. The Inter-American Commission and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights ("the Inter-American Court" or “I/A Court H.R.”) have established repeatedly that precautionary and provisional measures have a dual nature, both protective and precautionary.3 Regarding the protective
nature, these measures seek to avoid irreparable harm and protect the exercise of human rights. To do this, the IACHR shall assess the problem raised, the effectiveness of state actions to address the situation described, and the vulnerability to which the persons proposed as beneficiaries would be exposed if the measures were not adopted. Regarding their precautionary nature, these measures have the purpose of preserving a legal situation while under consideration by the organs of the inter-American system. They aim to safeguard the rights at risk until the petition pending before the inter-American system is resolved. Their object and purpose are to ensure the integrity and effectiveness of an eventual decision on the merits and, thus, avoid any further infringement of the rights at issue, a situation that may adversely affect the useful effect (effet utile) of the final decision. In this regard, precautionary or provisional measures enable the State concerned to comply with the final decision and, if necessary, to implement the ordered reparations. In the process of reaching a decision, according to Article 25(2) of its Rules of Procedure, the Commission considers that:

a. “serious situation” refers to a grave impact that an action or omission can have on a protected right or on the eventual effect of a pending decision in a case or petition before the organs of the inter-American system;

b. “urgent situation” refers to risk or threat that is imminent and can materialize, thus requiring immediate preventive or protective action; and

c. “irreparable harm” refers to injury to rights which, due to their nature, would not be susceptible to reparation, restoration or adequate compensation.

23. With regard to the foregoing, Article 25(7) of the Commission’s Rules of Procedure establishes that decisions “granting, extending, modifying or lifting precautionary measures shall be adopted through reasoned resolutions.” Article 25(9) sets forth that “the Commission shall evaluate periodically, at its own initiative or at the request of either party, whether to maintain, modify or lift the precautionary measures in force.” In this regard, the Commission should assess the situation’s severity and urgency and the possibility of irreparable harm that caused the adoption of the precautionary measures persists. Moreover, the Commission shall consider if new situations that might meet the requirements set forth in Article 25 of the Rules of Procedure have arisen.

24. Similarly, while the assessment of the procedural requirements when adopting precautionary measures is carried out from a prima facie standard, keeping such measures in force requires a more rigorous evaluation. In this sense, when no imminent risk is identified, the burden of proof and argument increases over time. The Inter-American Court has indicated that the passage of a reasonable period without any threats or intimidation, in addition to the lack of imminent risk, may lead to the lifting of international protection measures.

---


6 I/A Court H.R. Matter of Fernández Ortega et al, Provisional measures regarding Mexico, Order of February 7, 2017, considerandums 16 and 17.

7 Ibidem

8 Ibidem
25. In the matter at hand, the Commission recalls that at the time of granting the precautionary measures in February 2020, a multiplicity of risk factors were identified, such as: i) the center was not built for detention; ii) overcrowding was higher than 1000%; iii) there were strong episodes of violence; iv) the center was controlled by the so-called "Pranes" (leaders) of the cellblocks; v) there were no security measures; vi) the detainees were involved in extortion; vii) security personnel were qualified in the request as a "source of corruption"; viii) there were high degrees of malnutrition and tuberculosis without medical and timely attention; ix) an isolation area in unsanitary and inadequate conditions to address medical conditions was improvised; x) food and access to water was reportedly precarious. In the light of these conditions, the Commission assessed the information available in the light of the prohibition of torture and the prohibition of violence against women, in accordance with the applicable international instruments.

26. In this sense, the Commission notes the persistence of the risk factors while the Cabimas Remand Facility remained operational. Furthermore, it considers fundamental the extensive information that has been provided by the representation during this period. In this regard, the Commission stresses that the information provided shows the absence of access to medical care, especially in the presence of tuberculosis, a disease for which dozens of deaths were reported during the time the precautionary measures were in force, together with the persistence of unhealthy and inadequate living conditions for sick people in the center. In turn, it notes the continuous demands of the prison population for access to food, drinking water, and medicines, having to protest repeatedly for this, an issue that was further complicated by the restrictions of the COVID-19 pandemic. In relation to this, the Commission considers that the previous situations placing the beneficiaries at risk were intensified in the presence of the exceptional situation caused by COVID-19, which required special measures to protect the prison population.

27. Furthermore, the Commission notes that serious acts of violence continued to occur. They mainly took place due to rivalry between the different "Pranes" or leaders of the cellblocks and were possible in the face of the alleged lack of control by the authorities. These situations of violence had a direct impact on the prison population and the guards for being victims of them and for the effects that the violence had on the entry of food, medicine, and drinking water. Together with the violence exercised within the prison, the Commission notes the allegations about the use of force by state actors, with multiple deaths of people after escaping from the prison and allegations of resistance to arrest. The Commission did not receive clear information on the use of lethal force against them in such cases. The Commission does not have the results of the investigations that have been opened to clarify the facts and determine responsibilities, as appropriate.

28. Moreover, the Commission emphasizes that the information provided does not indicate the application of measures with a differentiated approach for the protection of pregnant women and those who are mothers, as requested by the Commission when granting precautionary measures (see supra para. 2), or in favor of other groups in particularly vulnerable situations such as people with disabilities, children, or elderly people, among others that require it.

29. In this regard, the Commission regrets the continuous lack of information from the State, both prior to the granting of the precautionary measures, in accordance with Article 25(5) of the IACHR Rules of Procedure, as well as at the time of granting and after requests of August 26, 2020, and September 26, 2022. In addition, on February 3, 2023, the Commission called the State to a Public Hearing (see below,

---

9 IACHR, Cabimas Pretrial Detention Center regarding Venezuela ("Cabimas Remand Facility"), PM-23-20, Resolution 15/2020, February 6, 2020, paras. 31-34.
10 Ibidem, paras. 35-39.
para. 5) providing the possibility of presenting information on the implementation of precautionary measures without any response.

30. In this sense, the absence of accurate, detailed, and updated information from the State, which was exercising custody over the persons deprived of liberty in the Cabimas Remand Facility and was in charge of implementing security measures for these persons, those who worked there, and entered as visitors, has made it impossible for the Commission to have updated elements to assess in a timely manner if the situation placing the proposed beneficiaries at risk persisted. This is particularly serious given the nature of the events alleged at the time of the granting, as well as the information sent by the representation of the persistence of serious situations within the Cabimas Remand Facility without adequate attention by the state authorities.

31. When analyzing the persistence of this matter, the Commission takes due note of the information presented by the representation in the sense that, after the announcement and actions of the governor, reported even before the granting, as well as the management of different authorities, including the “Presidential Commission for the Judicial Revolution” (Comisión Presidencial para la Revolución Judicial), on October 22 and 23, 2021, the eviction of the prison was completed and, on October 26, 2021, the demolition of the Cabimas Remand Facility began. Furthermore, the Commission has not had information from the representation since its last report of November 15, 2021, despite the request for information of September 26, 2022, the call to the Public Hearing that took place on March 6, 2023, and the reiteration of the request for information on March 6, 2023. Therefore, the Commission does not have the elements to consider the persistence of an imminent risk situation in relation to these precautionary measures.

32. Considering the foregoing, the IACHR does not recognize the existence of concrete facts that may allow identifying a situation placing the proposed beneficiary at risk under the terms of Article 25 of the Rules of Procedure. Due to the foregoing, the IACHR notes that the circumstances that led to the granting of these precautionary measures changed when the Cabimas Remand Facility closed down and was demolished, and the requirements of seriousness, urgency, and need to prevent a risk of irreparable harm are not met. In view of the above, and taking into account the exceptional and temporary nature of precautionary measures, the Commission deems it appropriate to lift these measures.

33. The Commission notes the extensive information provided by the representation during the time the precautionary measures were in force. This information mainly resulted in a high number of deaths of persons in state custody, beneficiaries of the present precautionary measures, due to acts of violence, lack of medical attention, and inadequate detention conditions. In this regard, as indicated when granting these precautionary measures, the Commission wishes to recall that, by its own mandate, it is not appropriate to rule on the criminal responsibility of individuals, nor to determine whether there were violations of due process in this mechanism since the foregoing requires an analysis on the merits, which is better suited to a petition or case. The analysis carried out within the framework of the precautionary measures mechanism is exclusively based on the requirements set forth in Article 25 of the Rules of Procedure, in this case, regarding whether the requirements are still met. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Commission recalls the obligation of the State to carry out serious and diligent investigations in

---


12 Ibidem, para. 28.
relation to the alleged events that gave rise to the granting of the precautionary measures, as well as the events reported during the time these were in force.

34. Lastly, the Commission emphasizes that, regardless of the lifting of these measures, the State of Venezuela has the obligation to respect and guarantee the rights recognized in the applicable instruments.

V. DECISION

35. The Commission decides to lift the precautionary measures granted in favor of the men and women deprived of their liberty in the Cabimas Pretrial Detention Center, as well as those who work there and those who enter as visitors, in Venezuela.

36. The Commission instructs the Executive Secretariat to notify this resolution to the State of Venezuela and to the representation.

37. Approved on April 16, 2023, by Margarete May Macaulay, President; Esmeralda Arosemena de Troitiño, First Vice-President; Roberta Clarke, Second Vice-President; Joel Hernández García; Julissa Mantilla Falcón; Edgar Stuardo Ralón Orellana; and Carlos Bernal Pulido, members of the IACHR.

Norma Colledani Toranzo
By authorization of the Executive Secretary