

Regional Workshop on Sharks Listed in Appendix II of CITES - Preparing for Implementation

2-4 December 2013, Recife, Brazil

SUMMARY

More than 70 participants representing 28 countries from Latin America and the Caribbean gathered in Recife, Brazil, from 2 to 4 December to participate in a [workshop](#) focused on the implementation of new measures for international trade of five shark species, adopted by the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES).

Experts covered a range of legal, administrative and scientific topics at the workshop, based on concrete needs identified by countries. Specifically, the workshop provided information on and demonstrated the use of tools and techniques that will help advance identification of sharks, improve data collection and data reporting on shark catch in the region, and enhance the tracking of shark specimens in trade. Participants were provided with real-life examples of how CITES is implemented for several currently listed species and demonstrated how a chain of custody can be established to monitor shark products from the point of harvest to the point of export.

The workshop also helped to increase awareness of international measures related to shark conservation and management. Participants identified regional needs and next steps for implementing the CITES shark listings in Latin American and Caribbean countries. Scientific surveys on the status of sharks species, domestic legislation, harmonization of Customs codes for trade in sharks and technology transfer for DNA testing, were among the priorities mentioned. These priority areas are expected to help guide future activities leading up to the September 2014 effective date.

DAY ONE

Topics:

- **Establishing the Context: CITES Appendix II requirements for sharks**
- **Identification Techniques and Tools for CITES-Listed Sharks**

Presentations:

- [Welcome and introductory remarks](#) – Fabio Hazin, Universidade Federal Rural de Pernambuco (UFRPE), Brazil
- **Overview of CITES Appendix II Requirements for Sharks** – Panel Format moderated by **Fabio Hazin**: *Provided an overview of the requirements for international trade in specimens of Appendix-II sharks. Explained why identification tools and establishing a chain of custody for shark products in international trade are useful and important.*

- [Overview of CITES and Appendix II Requirements and Marine Species in CITES](#) by Juan Carlos Vasquez, CITES Secretariat
- [Introduction from the Sea](#) by Fabio Hazin
- [CITES Appendix II in Action](#): CITES Appendix II implementation and regulations - including collaboration of different agencies and offices (ex. fisheries, customs, enforcement) by Carlos Polo, Jefe Oficina de Generación del Conocimiento y la Información AUNAP, Government of Colombia
- [Overview of Shark Identification Guides and Tools](#) by Jimmy Martinez, WWF (formerly Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock, Aquaculture and Fisheries, Government of Ecuador): *Provided a general overview of the type of [guides](#) and tools that are available to ensure that participants are aware that resources are available and point out that a variety of tools are needed for a variety of audiences including fishermen, port authorities and custom authorities.*
- [Overview of Software for Shark Identification](#) by Monica Barone, FAO: *Introduced FAO's software for identification of shark fins in trade based on measurements, including the fins of CITES-listed shark species and fins of shark species that are similar in appearance.*

Afternoon sessions moderated by Ramon Bonfil, URFPE

- [Shark Fin Guide Presentation](#) by Demian Chapman, Stony Brook University: *Shared the [shark fin identification guide](#) and demonstrated how it is used to identify the fins of the CITES-listed shark species.*
- [Genetic Approaches for Shark Identification](#) by John Hyde, NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service, Government of the United States: *Discussed genetic [identification tools](#) to assist in the [identification](#) of shark products in trade and demonstrated techniques using [handouts](#) and a [video](#).*
- [Training on the Use of Shark Identification Guides](#) for Mexico, Caribbean, Central, and South America by Juan Carlos Cantu, Defenders of Wildlife: *Shared shark identification guides and demonstrated how they can be used to identify the CITES-listed shark species.*
 - [Mexico, Central America and the Caribbean](#)
 - [Mexico and Central America Pacific Ocean](#)
 - [South America Atlantic Ocean](#)
 - [South America Pacific Ocean](#)

Breakout groups with 4 stations and each group will take a turn at each station:

- Shark identification guides
- Shark fin identification guide
- FAO software
- DNA testing

DAY TWO

Topics:

- **Making a Legal Acquisition Finding under CITES**
- **Establishing a Chain of Custody for Shark Products in Trade**
- **Breakout group discussions and brain storming**
- **Moving Forward: Identification of Next Steps and Regional Priorities**

Presentations:

- **Making a Legal Acquisition Finding under CITES** – Panel Format moderated by **Maria Elena Sanchez, SSN/Teyeliz**: *Introduced and showcased how legal acquisition relates to the spectrum of possible management regimes for CITES-listed species. Real-life examples help CITES Parties get a better sense of how a legal acquisition can be made and help others understand how to approach implementation of the CITES shark listings that were adopted at CoP16.*
 - [How to Make a Legal Acquisition Finding and Relevant Existing CITES Resolutions that Might be Applicable](#) by **Juan Carlos Vasquez, CITES Secretariat**
 - [RFMO Shark Measures and how these can be used in Legal Acquisition Findings](#) by **Ramon Bonfil**
 - [Examples from Parties on Legal Acquisition Findings for Specific Species and/or Situations](#) by **Juan Pablo Caldas, Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development, Government of Colombia** and [paddlefish](#) example by **Laura Noguchi, Fish and Wildlife Service, Government of the United States**
- [Establishing a Chain of Custody for Shark Products in Trade](#) by **Jimmy Martinez, WWF (formerly Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock, Aquaculture and Fisheries, Government of Ecuador)**: *Demonstrated how a chain of custody for sharks could serve as a model for other CITES Parties for monitoring shark products in trade.*
- [Fish Document of Origin](#) by **Henrique Anatole, IBAMA, Ministério do Meio Ambiente, Government of Brazil**: *Presented a proposed system for the control and traceability of fish products.*

Break out groups by regions for discussions on strategies for applying the knowledge gained from the workshop in each of the participant countries: *Reflected on the workshop, shared [information](#) and experiences, identified and prioritized gaps, and discussed how to use the knowledge acquired at the workshop to effectively implement the CITES Appendix II requirements for sharks.*

- [The Caribbean](#)
- [Mexico and Central America](#)
- [South America Atlantic Ocean](#)

- [South America Pacific Ocean](#)

Moving Forward: Regional Priorities and Next Steps *Summarized the findings of the break out groups and discussed priority needs for the region, next steps and how to collectively work to address priority needs including at future workshops.*

Closing Remarks – Brazilian Government

PARTICIPANTS

The workshop was attended by representatives from the governments of Barbuda, Bahamas, Belize, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Cuba, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Grenada, Guatemala, Honduras, Jamaica, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama, Peru, St. Kitts and Nevis, St. Lucia, Uruguay and the United States.

ORGANIZERS

The governments of Brazil and the United States, Defenders of Wildlife, Humane Society International, the Species Survival Network and Teyeliz with support from US NOAA, the Organization of American States (OAS) Western Hemisphere Migratory Species Initiative (WHMSI) and the CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora) Secretariat and special thanks to the FAO, Pam Scruggs, Susana Caballero, Diego Cardeñosa and Todd Capson.

**Regional Workshop on Sharks Listed in Appendix II of CITES - Preparing for
Implementation
2-4 December 2013, Recife, Brazil**

**REPORT ON REGIONAL NEEDS FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CITES SHARK
LISTINGS & NEXT STEPS**

The participants then divided into regional groups (the Caribbean, Mexico and Central America, South America Atlantic and South America Pacific) to discuss how they can use the information learned from the presenters in their countries or regions, share experiences, and identify and prioritize needs for implementing the shark listings. They were given a set of questions to consider and they presented their findings to the full group afterwards and a group discussion followed. This is a summary of the priority needs and next steps identified during those sessions.

Improve fisheries management including species identification and monitoring:

- Use ecological risk assessments and seek support from scientific experts from relevant tuna RFMOs to help determine the population status of the CITES listed shark species in the absence of stock assessments.
- Share identification guides with fishermen and government officials (Customs, CITES authorities, fisheries ministry) as appropriate to assist in species identification and improved monitoring of CITES-listed sharks.
- Develop a regional tagging program for hammerheads.
- Find funding for and set up at least one portable DNA lab in each country; in the meantime, each country can identify and establish partnerships with universities in their country that have genetic labs.
- Ensure that fishing permits are implemented in each country to facilitate with monitoring.

Provide education on the CITES requirements:

- Conduct public education on CITES and pertinent domestic regulations to help raise awareness of the CITES shark listings that will become effective in September 2014 and its requirements.

- Tell fishers how proper species identification could improve prices they receive for their products.

Put procedures in place for implementing trade measures to comply with CITES

- Move towards the use of electronic permits for CITES.
- See how Ecuador's traceability program could be applied in other countries.
- Work to harmonize tariff codes for sharks and shark products in trade.
- Look at OSPESCA's harmonized landing form as an example for standardized data reporting of shark catch and try to apply it to improve trade monitoring.
- Review processes that have been developed to monitor the harvest and trade of other CITES-listed species (for mahogany as an example) to help guide the monitoring of the products of CITES-listed sharks in trade.
- Work to identify regional priorities, develop and share funding ideas and sources.
- Review regulatory frameworks and identify gaps in legislation to address these.
- Connect with and make use of experts, such as experts on genetic identification techniques, and connect with labs that have the equipment to request equipment for countries that do not have it.

Provide training on implementation:

- Determine all the actors involved in the trade of CITES-listed sharks and shark products and then organize national meetings with everyone involved in the trade (not just fisheries and environment authorities).
- Improve interagency coordination on implementation of the CITES listings through information sharing and communication.
- Develop an e-tool kit that can be used for training when there are changes in enforcement personnel.
- Train Customs officials, including teaching airport and port authorities, how to take genetic samples when needed.

- Develop and share guidance amongst countries in the region on how to make non-detriment findings (NDFs) for the CITES-listed shark species, preferably on a regional basis.

Next steps:

- Create a flow chart or infograph with all the steps for implementing the shark listings could be created, from fisheries to export (such as population information, fishing limits, management plan, control points, species and fin identification, genetics, etc.) to help provide a clear picture of the whole process.
- The FAO has identified countries and 3 areas that need assistance on a priority basis – West Central Africa, Southeast Asia, and Latin America. CITES/FAO will be holding regional consultative workshops with countries on their needs and receiving specific requests for assistance. They can only support the participation of priority countries but others can fund their own attendance. The first one will be for Africa in early 2014, then Latin America in March 2014 and Asia in April 2014. They intend to develop a range of projects to support the shark listings in CITES Appendix II, ideally before September 2014.
- Disseminate information on the tools and information needed to assist in implementation of the CITES shark listings on a national level with coordination amongst the relevant authorities (including Customs authorities).
- Development and implementation of a chain of custody and legal acquisition finding mechanisms for the CITES-listed sharks.
- Strengthen national capacities with identification tools, including DNA techniques.
- Harmonize Customs codes at a regional level.
- Hold a regional workshop on NDFs.
- Create a discussion list of all participants so that information can be exchanged on a permanent basis including providing assistance and giving suggestions to each other.